

THE LAND PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT (GUERNSEY) LAW, 2005

AND SECTION 19 OF THE LAND PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT (GENERAL PROVISIONS) ORDINANCE, 2007

NOTIFICATION OF REFUSAL OF PLANNING PERMISSION

PROPOSALS: Demolish extensions and outbuilding, erect single storey extension, install dormer window and rooflight to north (rear) elevation, install rooflights to south (front) elevation, repair chimney and roof covering, re-render and alter fenestration and internal alterations (protected building).

LOCATION: Narrabri, La Biloterie Road, St. Saviour.

APPLICANT: Mr J Hibble

I refer to the application referred to below received as valid on 09/11/2022 regarding the above proposals as described more fully in the application and drawings referred to below.

Date of refusal of permission: 22/11/2023

Drawing Nos: g2a drawing no's: 2795-01 B1b, B2b & B3a

Application Ref: FULL/2022/1883

Property Ref: E008020000

The Development & Planning Authority has decided to refuse your application under the provisions of section 16 of the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law, 2005 for the following reasons:-

1. The development if approved would have a significant detrimental effect on the overall special interest of the protected building, by virtue of the partial demolition of the protected building. The proposal would be contrary to Policy GP5 (Protected Buildings) of the Island Development Plan.

2. The proposed flat roof extension is disproportionate to the size and proportion of the protected building by virtue of its mass and bulk and does not represent a 'high' standard of design as required for a protected building (Policy GP8). In addition, the introduction of an extension of this size would be at odds with the surrounding built environment to the north of La Biloterie Road, to the detriment of the character and appearance of the surrounding area. Consequently, the proposed design is sufficient to rebut the flexibility afforded to householders so that reasonable development aspirations can be met (Policy GP13). The development would be contrary to Island Development Plan Policies GP8 and GP13.

OTHER REMARKS:-**Right of appeal against planning decisions**

Your attention is drawn to the provisions of Section 68(1) of the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law 2005, which provides a right of appeal, against a decision to refuse an application for planning permission or outline planning permission to the Planning Tribunal on the merits. An appeal to the Planning Tribunal under section 68 of the Law against this decision must be made before the expiry of the period of six months beginning with the date on which the Authority made this decision.

Copy of representations made

In reaching this decision the Development & Planning Authority took into account any written consultations made under Section 11(1) of the Land Planning and Development (General Provisions) Ordinance, 2007 ('the Ordinance'). A copy of any consultation responses made to the Authority under section 11 will be included with this decision in accordance with section 19 of the Ordinance.

A J ROWLES

Director of Planning
Planning Service



PLANNING APPLICATION REPORT

Application No: FULL/2022/1883
Property Ref: E008020000
Valid date: 09/11/2022
Location: Narrabri La Biloterie Road St. Saviour Guernsey GY7 9QX
Proposal: Demolish extensions and outbuilding, erect single storey extension, install dormer window and rooflight to north (rear) elevation, install rooflights to south (front) elevation, repair chimney and roof covering, re-render and alter fenestration and internal alterations (protected building).
Applicant: Mr J Hibble

RECOMMENDATION - Refusal with Reasons:

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

1. The development if approved would have a significant detrimental effect on the overall special interest of the protected building, by virtue of the partial demolition of the protected building. The proposal would be contrary to Policy GP5 (Protected Buildings) of the Island Development Plan.
 2. The proposed flat roof extension is disproportionate to the size and proportion of the protected building by virtue of its mass and bulk and does not represent a 'high' standard of design as required for a protected building (Policy GP8). In addition, the introduction of an extension of this size would be at odds with the surrounding built environment to the north of La Biloterie Road, to the detriment of the character and appearance of the surrounding area. Consequently, the proposed design is sufficient to rebut the flexibility afforded to householders so that reasonable development aspirations can be met (Policy GP13). The development would be contrary to Island Development Plan Policies GP8 and GP13.
-

OFFICER'S REPORT

Site Description:

The application site comprises a traditional detached dwelling-house located to the north of La Biloterie. The property is sited parallel and at a short distance from the road, and is set within grounds to the side (east) and rear (north). All of the site is recognised as domestic curtilage.

The whole of Narrabri is protected, together with the detached outbuilding to the north. It is understood that the building dates to c.1680 with subsequent phases of development in the 18th and 19th centuries. The building features a 'back kitchen' (the

stone-built ridged, pantile roof extension) which is located to the rear of the cottage. There are also ruins of megalithic walling to the east of the wing, which may have been foundations of a building, or an earlier house.

The property lies Outside of the Centres as designated on the Island Development Plan Proposals Map.

Relevant History:

None.

Existing Use(s):

Residential.

Brief Description of Development:

Planning permission is sought to demolish extensions and an outbuilding, erect a single storey flat roof extension, install a dormer window and a rooflight to north (rear) elevation. The application also includes installing rooflights to the south (front) elevation, repair a chimney and roof covering, re-render and make internal and external alterations to the property.

The application is supported by a Statement of Significance and heat map of special interest which give a brief history of the building, a description of the house and explains the proposals.

The application has been deferred on multiple occasions. The deferrals have set out issues relating to the design of the extension, and the impact on the special interest of the protected building. The agent has provided additional information, including a Structural Report, and has reduced the size of the extension, to seek to overcome the concerns raised.

The floor plan of the proposed extension shows a kitchen, dining and living room, two bedrooms, a utility, and two family bathrooms.

Relevant Policies of any Plan, Subject Plan or Local Planning Brief:

GP5 Protected Buildings
GP8 Design
GP9 Sustainable development
GP13 Householder Development

Representations:

None.

Consultations:

None.

Summary of Issues:

- Whether the extension and alterations would have a detrimental effect on the fabric of the protected building.
- Whether the design, scale, mass, siting, form and materials of the proposed development is acceptable.
- Whether the proposal would affect the character and appearance of the surrounding area.
- Whether the proposal would affect the amenities of neighbouring residents.

Assessment against:

- 1 - Purposes of the law.**
- 2 - Relevant policies of any Plan, Subject Plan or Local Planning Brief.**
- 3 - General material considerations set out in the General Provisions Ordinance.**
- 4 - Additional considerations (for protected trees, monuments, buildings and/or SSS's).**

All material considerations as set out in the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law, 2005 and the Land Planning and Development (General Provisions) Ordinance, 2007 have been considered in the assessment of this application.

Whether the extension and alterations would have a detrimental effect on the fabric of the protected building:

The Island Development Plan policy directly relevant to the assessment of the application is Policy GP5 (Protected Buildings). This states that proposals to extend or alter a protected building will be supported where the development does not have an adverse effect on the special interest of the particular protected building or its setting.

Furthermore, it is a requirement under the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law, 2005, when considering applications affecting protected buildings, to secure so far as possible that the special historic, architectural, traditional or other special characteristics (including setting) are preserved.

The back kitchen, which comprises a clay tiled pitched roof extension to the rear of the property, together with the smaller lean-to roof extension would be demolished as part of this application.

The lean-to structure detracts from the special interest of the protected building and so its proposed demolition meets Policy GP5. The back kitchen is likely to be an 18th century structure which positively contributes to the special interest of the building. The structure appears to be in poor condition but based on the Structural Report

submitted, the structure is capable of retention, and therefore could be used as part of the development.

A comprehensive and well-designed scheme can often complement older structures, incorporating them within new development, which can help to contrast between old and new elements of a building. In this case, achieving this would appear possible by integrating the back kitchen into the design, through a holistic approach.

As set out in Policy GP5 there is a presumption against the partial demolition of a protected building and this will only be permitted where it is demonstrated that the building is structurally unsound and is technically incapable of repair or; the demolition or partial demolition relates to a structure which detracts from the special interest of the protected building; or it could contribute or enhance the Main Centre via economic, social or other benefits.

In this case, the back kitchen positively contributes to the special interest of the protected building, is technically capable of repair and could be repurposed, and the site is Outside of the Centres. On this basis, the proposal would conflict with Policy GP5.

Whether the design, scale, mass, siting, form and materials of the proposed development is acceptable and whether the proposal would affect the character and appearance of the surrounding area:

The agent has been provided with an opportunity to amend the design of the scheme and has reduced the footprint of the ground floor extension. Whilst these revisions are noted, the size of the flat roof extension is still disproportionate to the size and proportion of the protected building by virtue of its mass and bulk. The projection from the main house is approximately 14m in length, and it is circa. 9-10m in width.

Policy GP8 states that:

“Some parts of the Island are more sensitive to building design than others. Within Conservation Areas and where development relates to protected buildings or protected monuments and their settings, development will be expected to achieve a particularly high standard of design which should respect the character of the particular environment concerned. This may result in either a contemporary or traditional approach to design but, whatever the chosen approach, new development in such circumstances should consider, without necessarily replicating, the scale, mass, detail and special interest of the surrounding built form to complement the local character.”

Considering Policy GP8, the extent to which the proposed extension projects from the main cottage, coupled with the mass and bulk of the flat roof structure, and its appropriateness to a building of this age, does not represent a 'high' standard of design as required in this sensitive setting. In addition, the footprint of the extension would be at odds with the rear built form to the north of La Biloterie Road, to the detriment of the character and appearance of the surrounding area.

In its current form, the proposed design is sufficient to rebut the flexibility afforded to householders so that reasonable development aspirations can be met (Policy GP13).

The development would be contrary to Island Development Plan Policies GP8 and GP13.

Whether the proposal would affect the amenities of neighbouring residents:

Whilst the utility and a family bathroom are located on the west boundary, and face directly towards the neighbouring property to the west, the impact could be avoided by conditioning these windows to be obscure glazed in order to protect the amenities of neighbouring residents. On this basis and subject to an appropriate condition, this aspect of the development would not add to the reasons for refusal.

For the reasons set out above, it is recommended that planning permission is refused.

Date: 21/11/2023